

討論一市民對一些字形的意見

陸勤

該市民 通過郵件對一些字形提出了意見，我們對這些意見進行了整理（郵件原文附於文件末），並提供了相關的參考資料和我們的建議，供工作小組考慮。

1. 「𧯛」(U+4E84) 左部的末筆

該市民的意見：左部的末筆用提，不用橫。

參考資料：

4E84 乙 5.12	𧯛 𧯛 𧯛	𧯛				
	G5-3041 HB2-DCB2 T2-4157	K2-214A				
U+	Big5	工作字形 宋	常用字字形表 2000	大五碼	康熙字典 字典	台灣 MOE 宋
4E84	DCB2	𧯛	無	𧯛	𧯛	𧯛

【建議】

根據讓右的原則，應使用提，且「豆」部件位於左下部的其他字（如「艷」、「鄲」、「懿」等）均使用提，因此，**建議將此筆修改為提。**

2. 「𧯛」(U+50E0) 右部的上下兩個部件是否接觸

- 該市民的意見：這兩個部件應該接觸，如另一個字「勸」(U+52EB)，其左部的上下兩個部件互相接觸。
- 該市民的意見：這兩個部件不應該接觸，因為是不同的筆劃。
- 該市民的意見：如果不接觸，應該明顯分開，且應該具備一致性。

參考資料：

50E0 人 9.12	𧯛 𧯛 𧯛	𧯛	
	GE-223A HB2-E0FE T2-4926	K2-2355	

U+	Big5	工作字形 宋	常用字字形表 2000	大五碼	康熙字典	台灣 MOE 宋
50E0	E0FE		無			

52EB 力 19.12 G5-3523 HB2-E144 T2-492B K2-253F						
U+	Big5	工作字形 宋	常用字字形表 2000	大五碼	康熙字典	台灣 MOE 宋
52EB	E144		無			

【建議】

建議「番」的上下部件明顯分開，並所有含此部件的字保持一致。

3. 「儂」(U+5102) 的第 11 筆(橫)是否和第 10 筆(撇)接觸

- 該市民的意見：應接觸，如「唇」(U+5507)。
- 該市民的意見：傾向於第 11 筆不接觸，而第 12 筆接觸。

參考資料：

5102 人 9.13 G1-592F HB1-BBFA T1-6C25 J0-512F K1-5C49 V1-4C2F						
U+	Big5	工作字形 宋	常用字字形表 2000	大五碼	康熙字典	台灣 MOE 宋
5102	BBFA					

5507 口 30.7 G0-343D HB1-AE42 T1-5464 J0-3F30 K0-7246 V1-4F3C						
U+	Big5	工作字形 宋	常用字字形表 2000	大五碼	康熙字典	台灣 MOE 宋
5507	AE42		無			

【建議】

建議兩筆「一」都與「厂」接觸，並所有含此部件的字保持一致。

4. 「礪」(U+7921) 和「礪」(U+7934) 字形相同

- 該市民的意見：這兩個字的字形相同，這是一個錯誤，近期 *Unicode code charts* 中已經更正。
- 該市民的意見：建議 0xF2A1 和 0xFEE8 都 map 到 U+7934。U+7921 存在是因為台灣的錯誤，現在，台灣教育部《異體字字典》中使用 U+7934 作為正體字。
- 該市民的意見：可能可以使用類似橫向擴展的方式處理此問題，也就是，U+7921 和 U+7934 字形不同，但是 U+7934 字形更好。

參考資料：

7921 石 112.14 礪 礪 礪 GE-3559 HB2-F2A1 T2-662B						
U+	Big5	工作字形宋	常用字字形表 2000	大五碼	康熙字典	台灣 MOE 宋
7921	F2A1	礪	無	礪	無	礪

7934 石 112.16 礪 礪 礪 礪 G0-6D67 H-FEE8 J3-7932 K2-4D65						
U+	Big5	工作字形宋	常用字字形表 2000	大五碼	康熙字典	台灣 MOE 宋
7934	FEE8	礪	無	無	礪	礪

【建議】

將「礪」(U+7921) 的字形修改為「礪」。

5. 「竊」(U+7ACA) 的字形

- 該市民的意見：「竊」(U+7ACA) 的第 20 筆應該和第 19 筆接觸，但不應該穿出；第 21 筆應該和第 20 筆接觸，不應該穿出。
- 該市民的意見：現在的設計合理

參考資料：

7ACA 穴 116.17						
竊 竊 竊 竊 竊 G1-4754 HB1-C5D1 T1-7C3D J0-6366 K0-6F3C						
U+	Big5	工作字形 宋	常用字字形 表 2000	大五碼	康熙字典	台灣 MOE 宋
7ACA	C5D1					

【建議】

建議跟從《常用字字形表 2000》，也就是，不修改目前的字形。

6. 「賣」(U+8CE3) 和「贖」(U+8D15)、「贖」(U+8D16) 的右部不同

- 該市民的意見：「賣」(U+8CE3) 的第 6、7 筆和「贖」(U+8D15)、「贖」(U+8D16) 等字的右部部件不一致
- 該市民的意見：「贖」(U+8D15)、「贖」(U+8D16) 等字的部件為「賣」(U+27DA0)，而不是「賣」(U+8CE3)。在《常用字字形表 2000》中，這兩個部件是不能替換的。關於這個問題，他已發過郵件給 EDB，EDB 說在《小學學習字詞表》後續版本會考慮此問題。

參考資料：

8CE3 貝 154.8						
賣 賣 賣 賣 賣 賣 G1-4274 HB1-BDE6 T1-6F31 J0-6C4E K0-5863 V1-6832						
U+	Big5	工作字形 宋	常用字字形表 2000	大五碼	康熙字典	台灣 MOE 宋
8CE3	BDE6		 備註： 中作四，與四不同。			

27DA0 貝 154.8						
賣 賣 賣 賣 UCS2003 GKX-1209.32 T5-513A J4-792F						
U+	Big5	工作字形 宋	常用字字形表 2000	大五碼	康熙字典	台灣 MOE 宋
27DA0	-	無	無	無		無

8D15 貝 154.15						
	卵贖	卵贖	卵贖	卵贖		
	G3-3033	HB2-F75C	T2-6E2B	K2-6272		
U+	Big5	工作字形宋	常用字字形表 2000	大五碼	康熙字典	台灣 MOE 宋
8D15	F75C	卵贖	無	卵贖	卵贖	卵贖

8D16 貝 154.15						
	贖贖贖	贖贖贖	贖贖贖	贖贖贖		
	G1-4A6A	HB1-C5AB	T1-7B75	J0-6C5E	K0-615B	V1-683C
U+	Big5	工作字形 宋	常用字字形表 2000	大五碼	康熙字典	台灣 MOE 宋
8D16	C5AB	贖	贖	贖	贖	贖

【建議】


建議跟從《常用字字形表 2000》和《康熙字典》，也就是，不修改賣(U+8CE3)、贖(U+8D15)、贖(U+8D16)目前的字形。

7. 「𪚩」(U+99A7) 左下部部件

該市民的意見：和其他含相同部件的字不一致

U+	Big5	工作字形宋
99A7	F3B3	𪚩

【建議】

將此字改為和其他含此部件的字一致，例如：


8. 「艺」(U+827A) 等字的上部部件

該市民的意見：「艺」(U+827A) 等字的上部部件是來自部首

「艸」，繁體字都作「艸」（四劃），但簡化苾字則簡化為「艸」（三劃）。

此類字包括：

艺(U+827A)、苏(U+82CF)、荣(U+8363)、葦(U+8366)、药(U+836F)、
 萤(U+8424)、藜(U+8426)、莖(U+84E5)、勝(U+266E8)

參考資料：

827A 艸 140.1							
艺		艺	艺				
G0-5255		H-8976	V0-422B				
U+	HKSCS	工作字形 宋	HKSCS -1999	HKSCS -2008	大五碼	康熙字典	台灣 MOE 宋
827A	8976	艺	艺	艺	無	無	無

【建議】

此為簡化漢字，目前工作字形根據 *HKSCS-1999* 和 *HKSCS-2008*，不建議修改。

9. 「莹」(U+83B9) 的上部部件

該市民的意見：「莹」(U+83B9) 字的上部部件也是如簡化字，但為斜豎。

參考資料：

83B9 艸 140.7							
莹		莹	莹				
G0-5328		H-FE76	TF-3778				
U+	HKSCS	工作字形 宋	HKSCS -1999	HKSCS -2008	大五碼	康熙字典	台灣 MOE 宋
83B9	FE76	莹	莹	莹	無	無	無

【建議】

此為風格問題，建議將此字修改為直豎，這樣便與第 8 項的各字保持一致。

10. 「令」的第三劃

該市民的意見：「𨮒」(U+90BB)和「铃」(U+94C3)中「令」的第三劃不應作點，應該根從香港慣例作橫。

參考資料：

90BB 邑 163.5 𨮒 𨮒 G0-415A H-95D8							
U+	HKSCS	工作字形 宋	HKSCS -1999	HKSCS -2008	大五碼	康熙字典	台灣 MOE 宋
90BB	95D8	𨮒	𨮒	𨮒	無	無	無

94C3 钅 167.5 铃 铃 G0-4165 H-9AB8							
U+	HKSCS	工作字形 宋	HKSCS -1999	HKSCS -2008	大五碼	康熙字典	台灣 MOE 宋
94C3	9AB8	铃	铃	铃	無	無	無

根據香港的慣用寫法，「令」的第三劃為橫，在中文界面諮詢委員會中文電腦用字工作小組第58次會議¹上討論了此系列字該劃的問題，且明確：「今」、「令」、「麗」三個系列字保留「一」的寫法，不修改為「丶」。

【建議】

「𨮒」(U+90BB)和「铃」(U+94C3)為簡化漢字，目前工作字形根據HKSCS-2008，「令」的第三劃從點，需由CLIAC決定是否修改此字形。

11. 「夂」的第三、四劃

該市民的意見：「骏」(U+9A8F)與「陵」、「黠」、「浚」、「墜」、「後」、

¹ 會議記錄見：

http://www.ogcio.gov.hk/tc/business/tech_promotion/ccli/cliac/doc/minutes_of_the_58th_WG-CHAR_meeting.pdf

「駿」、「慶」等比較，「夂」的三、四劃有不一致。

參考資料：

9A8F 馬 187.7 駿 駿 G0-3F25 H-89C7							
U+	HKSCS	工作字形 宋	HKSCS -1999	HKSCS -2008	大五碼	康熙字典	台灣 MOE 宋
9A8F	89C7	駿	駿	駿	無	無	無

99FF 馬 187.7 駿 駿 駿 駿 駿 駿 G1-3F25 HB1-C240 T1-762C J0-3D59 K0-7167 V1-6C46						
U+	Big5	工作字形 宋	常用字字形表 2000	大五碼	康熙字典	台灣 MOE 宋
99FF	C240	駿	駿	駿	駿	駿

【建議】

此為簡化漢字，目前「駿」的工作字形根據 *HKSCS-2008*，「夂」的三、四劃作「夂」，需由 *CLIA*C 決定是否修改此字形。

12. 「渙」(U+205EB) 的第七、八劃

該市民的意見：「渙」(U+205EB) 與「渙」、「衡」、「鎮」等比較，右部的五、六劃有不一致。

參考資料：

205EB 彳 15.9 渙 渙 UCS2003 H-945C							
U+	HKSCS	工作字形 宋	HKSCS -1999	HKSCS -2008	大五碼	康熙字典	台灣 MOE 宋
205EB	945C	渙	渙	渙	無	無	無

63DB 手 64.9	換	換	換	換	換	換
	G1-3B3B	HB1-B4AB	T1-5F50	J0-3439	K0-7C35	V2-8C51
U+	Big5	工作字形 宋	常用字字形表 2000	大五碼	康熙字典	台灣 MOE 宋
63DB	B4AB	換	換	換	換	換

【建議】

目前「換」的工作字形根據 *HKSCS-1999* 及 *HKSCS-2008*，「奐」的五、六劃作「儿」，需由 *CLAC* 決定是否修改此字形。

13. 「廉」(U+20A8A) 的第三劃

該市民的意見：「廉」(U+20A8A) 與「幪」、「灑」、「齠」等比較，「廉」的一劃有不一致。

參考資料：

20A8A 厂 27.10	廉	廉	廉		
	UCS2003	GKX-0162.34	T4-3653		
	廉				
	H-87A8				
U+	HKSCS	工作字形宋	<i>HKSCS-1999</i>	<i>HKSCS-2008</i>	康熙字典
20A8A	87A8	廉	無	廉	廉

517C 八 12.8	兼	兼	兼	兼	兼	兼
	G0-3C66	HB1-ADDD	T1-5440	J0-3773	K0-4C42	V1-4C50
U+	Big5	工作字形 宋	常用字字形表 2000	大五碼	康熙字典	台灣 MOE 宋
517C	ADDD	兼	兼	兼	兼	兼

兼·兼

根據 ISO/IEC 10646 認同規則，這兩種字形認同：

例如：



【建議】

《常用字字形表 2000》中有常用字「兼」可以類推，但目前的工作字形是遵從 HKSCS-2008，需由 CLIAC 決定是否修改此字形。

14. 「𦍋」(U+23033) 的第 12 劃是否穿出第 11 劃

該市民的意見：「𦍋」(U+23033) 第 12 劃應穿出第 11 劃

參考資料：

23033 𦍋 𦍋 𦍋 <small>支 66.18</small> UCS2003 GKX-0476.32 T5-7348 𦍋 <small>H-9B6C</small>							
U+	HKSCS	工作字形宋	HKSCS -1999	HKSCS -2008	大五碼	康熙字典	台灣 MOE 宋
23033	9B6C	𦍋	𦍋	𦍋	無	𦍋	無

【建議】

據《香港電腦字型參考指引》，「耳」在左，讓右為變體部件「𦍋」(序號 445)，即末筆不穿出豎。故不建議對工作字形作修改。

15. 審視「斲」(U+230BC) 的左上部件

該市民的意見：請審視「斲」(U+230BC) 的左上部件。

參考資料：

230BC 斤 69.11 斲 斲 斲 UCS2003 GKX-0480.22 T6-5D4D 斲 H-90E5						
U+	HKSCS	工作字形宋	HKSCS -1999	HKSCS -2008	參考指引	康熙字典
230BC	90E5	斲	斲	斲	斲	斲

【建議】

- 《康熙字典》引《集韻》指該字為「芹」的異體字，但《集韻》作「斲」(U+ 65B3)，故《康熙字典》為訛體，左上來自「斲」(《四聲篇海》，左下一缺橫是來自後世的誤抄，如《正字通》「斲」。
- 目前工作字形根據 *HKSCS-1999* 和 *HKSCS-2008*，需由 **CLIAC** 決定是否修改此字形。

16. 審視「謹」(U+27AF4) 的右上部件

該市民的意見：請審視「謹」(U+27AF4) 的右上部件

參考資料：

27AF4 言 149.11 謹 謹 UCS2003 H-98B6						
U+	HKSCS	工作字形宋	HKSCS -1999	HKSCS -2008	參考指引	康熙字典
27AF4	98B6	謹	謹	謹	謹	無

【建議】

目前「謹」(U+27AF4)的工作字形根據 *HKSCS-1999* 和 *HKSCS-2008*。而且存在另一個常用字：



因此，建議不修改目前的字形。

17. 審視「衡」(U+275FE)的「𠂔」部件

該市民的意見：請審視「衡」(U+275FE)的「𠂔」部件，該字應為「𠂔」(U+8861)的異體字。

參考資料：

275FE 行 144.10 衡 衡 UCS2003 H-9BA7							
U+	HKSCS	工作字形 宋	HKSCS -1999	HKSCS -2008	大五碼	康熙字典	台灣 MOE 宋
275FE	9BA7	衡	衡	衡	無	無	無

【建議】

「衡」(U+8861)篆文作「𠂔」，《五經文字》正為「從角從大，魚訛」。目前工作字形根據 *HKSCS-1999* 和 *HKSCS-2008*，故建議不作修改。

18. 「𠂔」的直筆穿出

該市民的意見：「𠂔」(U+24B0F)和「𠂔」(U+270D2) 𠂔 的「直筆應該穿出。

參考資料：

24B0F 瓜 97.11 瓠 瓠 瓠 UCS2003 GKX-0747.17 T4-513D 瓠 H-8D5B					
U+	HKSCS	工作字形宋	HKSCS-1999	HKSCS-2008	康熙字典
24B0F	8D5B	瓠	無	瓠	瓠

270D2 艸 140.17 縷 縷 縷 UCS2003 GKX-1069.21 T7-5466 縷 H-8754					
U+	HKSCS	工作字形宋	HKSCS-1999	HKSCS-2008	康熙字典
270D2	8754	縷	無	縷	縷

【建議】

HKSCS-2008 中的字形為不穿出，但是，根據中文界面諮詢委員會中文電腦用字工作小組第 57 次會議的決定²，部件「𠂔」(《參考指引》序號 592) 的直筆向下穿出。因此，建議根據此決定修改這兩個字的字形，使直筆向下穿出。

19. 「娉」(U+217B2) 的右上部部件

該市民的意見：「娉」(U+217B2) 的右上部與其他有相同部件的字形不一致。

參考資料：

217B2 女 38.9 娉 娉 UCS2003 H-FBAD						
U+	HKSCS	工作字形	HKSCS	HKSCS	大五碼	康熙 台灣

² 見：

http://www.ogcio.gov.hk/tc/business/tech_promotion/ccli/cliac/doc/minutes_of_the_57th_WG-CHAR_meeting.pdf

		宋	-1999	-2008		字典	MOE 宋
217B2	FBAD	嫖	嫖	嫖	無	無	無
另有「𨮑」(U+2695A) 只用於其他地區。							
2695A	𨮑 𨮑	𨮑 𨮑					
白 134.3	UCS2003 GHZ-53038.05						

【建議】

該字的右上部「𠂔」(直穿出)，和另一個獨立部件「𠂔」(部件碼：553)(直不穿出)(用於「叟搜瘦」等)相似，亦和「𠂔」相似。但工作字形遵從 HKSCS-1999 和 HKSCS-2008，因此，需由 CLIAC 決定是否修改此字形。

20. 「丕」(U+4E15) 的「不」是否與「一」接觸

的意見：「丕」(U+4E15) 的「不」是否與「一」接觸有不一致。

參考資料：

4E15 - 1.4	丕 丕 丕 丕 丕 丕					
	G0-5827 HB1-A541 T1-4561 J0-5023 K0-5D60 V1-4A2E					
U+	Big5	工作字形 宋	常用字字形表 2000	大五碼	康熙字典	台灣 MOE 宋
4E15	A541	丕	丕	丕	丕	丕

28E39 阜 170.5	陃 陃 陃						
	UCS2003 GHZ-64120.03 H-A0A4						
U+	HKSCS	工作字形 宋	HKSCS -1999	HKSCS -2008	大五碼	康熙字典	台灣 MOE 宋
28E39	A0A4	陃	陃	陃	無	無	無

【建議】

《常用字字形表 2000》中有常用字「丕」可以類推，故建議遵從《常用字字形表 2000》修改為明顯分開。

21. 「𧯛」內不一致

該市民的意見：「𧯛」內不一致，有的為「冫」，有的為「丕」。

參考資料：

74BA 玉 96.14	𧯛	𧯛	𧯛	𧯛	𧯛	
	G0-6837	HB2-F46F	T2-693E	J4-7128	K2-4856	
U+	Big5	工作字形 宋	常用字字形表 2000	大五碼	康熙字典	台灣 MOE 宋
74BA	F46F	𧯛	無	𧯛	𧯛	𧯛

91C1 西 164.18	𧯛	𧯛	𧯛	𧯛	𧯛	𧯛
	G1-5046	HB1-C65D	T1-7D2A	J0-6E57	K1-752A	V2-9060
U+	Big5	工作字形 宋	常用字字形表 2000	大五碼	康熙字典	台灣 MOE 宋
91C1	C65D	𧯛	𧯛	𧯛	𧯛	𧯛

在中文界面諮詢委員會中文電腦用字工作小組第 59 次會議³上，討論過「𧯛」(U+6596) 字的中間部件應採用哪種寫法，一致同意採用「冫」的寫法。

【建議】

- 目前，此三字的工作字形一致，都為「冫」：

𧯛 (U+820B)、𧯛 (U+4EB9)、𧯛 (U+6596)

而以下兩字的字形遵從了《常用字字形表 2000》，為「冫」：

𧯛 (U+91C1)、𧯛 (U+864B)

另有三個字，目前的工作字形如下：

³ 詳細信息見：

http://www.ogcio.gov.hk/tc/business/tech_promotion/ccli/cliac/doc/minutes_of_the_59th_WG-CHAR_meeting.pdf

𪔓 (U+7202)、𪔔 (U+7228)

𪔕 (U+74BA)

因此，待討論決定是否統一這些字的寫法。

該市民 郵件原文：

1. 郵件一：

I spent the past two weeks going through the Big Five portion of the Hong Kong SCS-2015 Technical Draft that you supplied, and have some feedback for you. It was very helpful for me, and I hope that this feedback is helpful for you.

First, please check the following representative glyph issues:

U+4E84: I think that the 12th stroke should be diagonal, not horizontal

U+50E0: The two right-side components should touch (see U+52EB and others)

U+5102: The 11th stroke should touch the 10th stroke (see U+5507 and others)

U+7921: The glyph is identical to that of U+7934 in that it has three extra strokes (Radical #85) -- this is definitely an error, as it was recently corrected in the Unicode code charts

U+7ACA: The connection of the 19th and 20th strokes is incorrect (the 20th stroke should touch, but not penetrate, the 19th stroke), along with that of the 20th and 21st strokes (the 21st stroke should touch, but not penetrate, the 20th stroke)

U+8CE3: The 6th and 7th strokes are not consistent with other characters that use this character as a component, such as U+8D15 and U+8D16

U+99A7: Lower-left component does not match other characters with the same component

In Section 3.1 there is a list of 22 hanzi for a horizontal extension. For reference, it might be useful to list the similar pairs that are already in Big Five + Hong Kong SCS:

U+6435 & U+63FE

U+6EAB & U+6E29

U+8580 & U+8570

Lastly, for the 14 characters that have Standardized Variants, because they are CJK Compatibility Ideographs, I suggest that you use "Standardized Variant" instead of "Variation Sequence" throughout the document. I found four instances of this.

I will now start to go through the characters outside of Big Five, and expect to have additional feedback for you within a week.

Best...

2. 郵件二：

Dear All,

I also have a list of problems, but they aren't ready yet. Most of them are consistency issues with the "n"/"d" stroke, and handling of "tn", "hn" and "n". Some overlap those mentioned with Ken, so I'll reply them earlier.

> U+4E84: I think that the 12th stroke should be diagonal, not horizontal
[Agree.](#)⁴

> U+50E0: The two right-side components should touch (see U+52EB and others)

⁴ 藍色為該市民的意見。

Actually, all of them shouldn't. They are written with two separate strokes. I remember I mentioned this earlier before in one of the face-to-face meetings, but I did not include a full list of all affected characters.

> U+5102: The 11th stroke should touch the 10th stroke (see U+5507 and others) Despite the 2007 version of 小學學習字詞表 having both strokes touch, I am in favor of unifying them all as third stroke not touch and fourth stroke touch. If the third stroke and fourth stroke touch the first stroke, then the correct stroke order would change to h,h,h,p. Currently, it is h,p,h,h. This indicates that h,p is one component, and h,h,sg,p,n is the second group. When two free (not connected to vertical stroke) "h" stacked on top of each other, there is no other place where the stroke would be left aligned. Other cases would be center aligned.

According to the Component List 2001, the 辰 character is broken into three parts. It does not specify any special joining. I checked with SimSun, MSungHK, DFLiSong and PMingLiu, the four main Song fonts used in print in Hong Kong. Only PMingLiU also exhibit this joining behavior. I think we need not follow the Taiwanese Government in this particular style of "Kai"-ification of characters.

> U+7921

The original character in 國字宋體母稿 was missing the 水 radical. I am not sure about the Big5 Standard though. However, I checked the only remaining "Big5-HKSCS only" commercial font in circulation (MSungHK) and they used the same CID for 0xF2A1 (U+7921) and (SCS) 0xFEE8 (U+7934). Since Big-5/SCS codepoint is being phased out already, I suggest that 0xF2A1 and 0xFEE8 be mapped back to the same codepoint U+7934, same argument: forward compatibility over round-trip compatibility. The only reason why U+7921 exists is because the Taiwanese Govt's accident. Now, the Taiwanese Govt uses U+7934 as the official character in its 教育部《異體字字典》.

> U+7ACA: The connection of the 19th and 20th strokes is incorrect (the 20th stroke should touch, but not penetrate, the 19th stroke), along with that of the 20th and 21st strokes (the 21st stroke should touch, but not penetrate, the 20th stroke)

I think this is the right design. Compare to 離, 萬, the bottom design of 𠂇 should be penetrating on both sides where necessary. Compare with 換, penetration of bottom component into top component is commonplace.

> U+8CE3: The 6th and 7th strokes are not consistent with other characters that use this character as a component, such as U+8D15 and U+8D16

I think this is expected. Other characters that use this component such as U+8D15 and U+8D16 are getting their sound from 𠄎 instead of 賣. The two components are not interchangeable in the 2000 version of the grapheme handbook. I've emailed the EDB on this before, and they said they will consider it in upcoming revisions of 小學學習字詞表 (if any).

> U+99A7: Lower-left component does not match other characters with the same component

Agreed.

3. 郵件三：

You wrote:

I also have a list of problems, but they aren't ready yet. Most of them are consistency issues with the "n"/"d" stroke, and handling of "tn", "hn" and "n". Some overlap those mentioned with Ken, so I'll reply them earlier.

Do you have a visual guide for the stroke shapes that correspond to the letters used in the paragraph above? It would be helpful for me.

U+50E0: The two right-side components should touch (see U+52EB and others)
Actually, all of them shouldn't. They are written with two separate strokes. I remember I mentioned this earlier before in one of the face-to-face meetings, but I did not include a full list of all affected characters.

If the components shouldn't touch, then there should be a clear separation. Some of them do touch, so this is a consistency issue.

At least for the Big Five portion, I think that I flagged all such characters. Would a list be helpful?

U+5102: The 11th stroke should touch the 10th stroke (see U+5507 and others)

Despite the 2007 version of 小學學習字詞表 having both strokes touch, I am in favor of unifying them all as third stroke not touch and fourth stroke touch. If the third stroke and fourth stroke touch the first stroke, then the correct stroke order would change to h,h,h,p. Currently, it is h,p,h,h. This indicates that h,p is one component, and h,h,sg,p,n is the second group. When two free (not connected to vertical stroke) "h" stacked on top of each other, there is no other place where the stroke would be left aligned. Other cases would be center aligned.

According to the Component List 2001, the 辰 character is broken into three parts. It does not specify any special joining. I checked with SimSun, MSungHK, DFLiSong and PMingLiu, the four main Song fonts used in print in Hong Kong. Only PMingLiU also exhibit this joining behavior. I think we need not follow the Taiwanese Government in this particular style of "Kai"-ification of characters.

Same thing. And, I flagged all such characters like the previous one.

U+7921

The original character in 國字宋體母稿 was missing the 水 radical. I am not sure about the Big5 Standard though. However, I checked the only remaining "Big5-HKSCS only" commercial font in circulation (MSungHK) and they used the same CID for 0xF2A1 (U+7921) and (SCS) 0xFEE8 (U+7934). Since Big-5/SCS codepoint is being phased out already, I suggest that 0xF2A1 and 0xFEE8 be mapped back to the same codepoint U+7934, same argument: forward compatibility over round-trip compatibility. The only reason why U+7921 exists is because the Taiwanese Govt's accident. Now, the Taiwanese Govt uses U+7934 as the official character in its 教育部《異體字字典》.

This might be handled in a way similar to the pairs of characters that correspond to the horizontal extension, meaning that U+7921 and U+7934 have distinct shapes, but that U+7934 is the preferred character.

U+7ACA: The connection of the 19th and 20th strokes is incorrect (the 20th stroke should touch, but not penetrate, the 19th stroke), along with that of the 20th and 21st strokes (the 21st stroke should touch, but not penetrate, the 20th stroke)

I think this is the right design. Compare to 離, 萬, the bottom design of 𠂇 should be penetrating on both sides where necessary. Compare with 換, penetration of bottom component into top component is commonplace.

This character appears in 小學學習字詞表, and the strokes do not penetrate. I immediately thought of characters like 離 and 萬, whose strokes clearly penetrate in 小學學習字詞表. This is why I am reporting this as a potential issue.

U+8CE3: The 6th and 7th strokes are not consistent with other characters that use this character as a component, such as U+8D15 and U+8D16

I think this is expected. Other characters that use this component such as U+8D15 and U+8D16 are getting their sound from 𠂇 instead of 賣. The two components are not interchangeable in the 2000 version of the grapheme handbook. I've emailed the EDB on this before, and they said they will consider it in upcoming revisions of 小學學習字詞表 (if any).

Understood.

U+99A7: Lower-left component does not match other characters with the same component

Agreed.

Another issue that I neglected to mention is the right-side component of U+4F2C (𠂇), which appears in about a dozen characters in Big Five (I flagged them all). This shape agrees with 小學學習字詞表, but to me it feels unbalanced. I would like to confirm that this shape is intentional, referring to the far-left starting point of the fourth/final stroke.

Anyway, it is clear that I will need to make a second pass through the Big Five portion, but before I do that, I will make a first pass through the non-Big Five portion so that I can provide feedback.

4. 郵件四：

Dr. Lu ,

Actually, I think that there are benefits to keeping the Big Five–derived portions as a separate table, for implementers who begin with Big Five as a base. This actually made my work much easier.

Also, I finished reviewing the non–Big Five portion, and my comments are below:

Additional Hong Kong SCS-2015 (Technical Draft) Comments by
04/12/2016

The following characters have a simplified (three-stroke) form of Radical #140 (I understand that some of these are simplified characters):

U+827A 艺

U+82CF 苏

U+8363 荣

U+8366 萃

U+836F 药

U+8424 萤

U+8426 萦

U+84E5 葢

U+266E8 勝

The following character also has a simplified (three-stroke) form of Radical #140, but

the two strokes are diagonal, like the traditional (four-stroke) form:

U+83B9 莹

The common middle component in the following characters is not consistent, which may or may not be intentional (NOTE: this is not a complete list):

U+4EB9 𧇗 (同)

U+7202 𧇗 (𠄎)

U+7228 𧇗 (𠄎)

U+74BA 𧇗 (同)

U+820B 𧇗 (同)

U+864B 𧇗 (𠄎)

U+91C1 𧇗 (𠄎)

I think that the 3rd stroke of the following character should be horizontal not diagonal to follow HK conventions (I understand that this is a simplified character):

U+90BB 邻

I think that the 8th stroke of the following character should be horizontal not diagonal to follow HK conventions (I understand that this is a simplified character):

U+94C3 铃

The 6th and 7th strokes of the following character are not consistent with other characters (compare with U+9656 陵, U+9EE2 駿, U+205D5 浚, U+21375 墜, U+224ED 後, U+28318 輟, U+2A2B4 慶):

U+9A8F 骏

The 7th and 8th strokes of the following character are not consistent with other characters (compare with U+217B5 煥, U+275FD 衡, U+28A49 鑛):

U+205EB 渙

I think that the 3rd stroke of the following character should be mirrored (compare with U+22173 幪, U+24144 灑, U+2A64A 𪗇):

U+20A8A 廉

I think that the 12th stroke of the following character should penetrate 11th stroke:

U+23033 𨇗

Please reconfirm the upper-left component of the following character:

U+230BC 斲

Please reconfirm the upper-right component of the following character:

U+27AF4 謹

Please confirm the top-middle components of the following character (this looks like a variant of U+8861 衡):

U+275FE 衡

The U+5A41 婁 component in all but the following characters has a vertical stroke that penetrates below:

U+24B0F 瓠

U+270D2 蘗

The upper-right component of the following character is not consistent with all other characters with the same component:

U+217B2 嫖

The following characters include U+4E15 丕 as a component, and the "touching" is inconsistent:

Big Five (16)

U+4E15 丕 (touching)

U+4F3E 𠄎 (not touching, but too close)

U+5478 𠄏 (not touching, but too close)

U+576F 𠄐 (not touching, but too close)

U+5CAF 𠄑 (not touching, but too close)

U+600C 𠄒 (touching)

U+67F8 𠄓 (touching)

U+72C9 𠄔 (not touching, but too close)

U+79E0 𠄕 (touching)

U+80DA 𠄖 (touching)

U+82E4 𠄗 (touching)

U+86BD 𠄘 (not touching, but too close)

U+90B3 邳 (touching)

U+99D3 駮 (touching)

U+9AEC 鬢 (touching)

U+9B7E 鯨 (touching)

HKSCS (3)

U+36B0 姪 (good example of not touching)
U+925F 銚 (touching)
U+28E39 阨 (good example of not touching)

The following characters include U+5C3A 尺 as a component, and the shape is consistent (this is mainly for my reference as a shape that is specific to HK):

Big Five (6)

U+4F2C 伋
U+544E 呎
U+54AB 咫
U+5C3A 尺
U+5EB9 度
U+8687 蚘

HKSCS (5)

U+6CA2 沢
U+7C8E 粳
U+99C5 馱
U+9FC8 徻
U+26B28 苻

The following characters include U+756A 番 as a component, and the "touching" is inconsistent:

Big Five (35)

U+50E0 番
U+52EB 翻 (touching)
U+58A6 藩 (touching)
U+5B0F 嬖 (touching)
U+5B38 嬖 (touching)
U+5BE9 審 (touching)
U+5D93 幡 (touching)
U+5E61 幡 (touching)
U+64AD 播 (touching)
U+65DB 旛 (touching)
U+6A4E 樞 (not touching, but too close)
U+6F58 潘 (touching)
U+700B 瀦 (not touching, but too close)
U+71D4 燻 (touching)
U+74A0 璠 (touching)

U+756A 番 (touching)
U+76A4 皤 (touching)
U+78FB 磻 (good example of not touching)
U+7C53 藩 (touching)
U+7E59 繻 (not touching, but too close)
U+7FB3 鞞 (touching)
U+7FFB 翻 (touching)
U+81B0 蹠 (not touching, but too close)
U+8543 蕃 (touching)
U+85E9 藩 (touching)
U+87E0 蟠 (touching)
U+89BE 覩 (touching)
U+8B52 謠 (not touching, but too close)
U+8B85 謠 (not touching, but too close)
U+8E6F 蹠 (not touching, but too close)
U+8F53 輶 (not touching, but too close)
U+9131 鄱 (touching)
U+9407 鑪 (touching)
U+9C55 鱻 (touching)
U+9DED 鵠 (touching)
HKSCS (5)
U+4AA4 鑪
U+5643 皤 (not touching, but too close)
U+98DC 翻 (touching)
U+210D3 皤
U+24ABA 璫 (not touching, but too close)

The following characters include U+8FB0 辰 as a component, and the "touching" is inconsistent:

Big Five (48)
U+4FB2 佹 (not touching, but too close)
U+5102 儂
U+5507 唇 (touching)
U+55D5 噲 (touching)
U+5665 噉 (touching)
U+5A20 娠 (not touching, but too close)
U+5AB7 媯 (touching)

U+5BB8 宸 (not touching, but too close)
U+5DA9 嶺
U+632F 振 (not touching, but too close)
U+64C3 摠 (not touching, but too close)
U+6668 晨 (not touching, but too close)
U+686D 振 (not touching, but too close)
U+6EBD 溥
U+6F18 溥 (not touching, but too close)
U+6FC3 濃 (not touching, but too close)
U+78ED 礪 (not touching, but too close)
U+7973 振 (not touching, but too close)
U+7A60 穠 (not touching, but too close)
U+7E1F 縟 (not touching, but too close)
U+7E77 縵 (not touching, but too close)
U+8028 穉 (not touching, but too close)
U+8123 脣 (touching)
U+8124 脈 (not touching, but too close)
U+81BF 膿 (touching)
U+84D0 蓐 (not touching, but too close)
U+8585 薈 (touching)
U+8703 蜃 (not touching, but too close)
U+8704 蜃 (not touching, but too close)
U+88D6 裨 (touching)
U+8925 裨 (touching)
U+895B 禮 (not touching, but too close)
U+8AAB 詼 (touching)
U+8B68 濃 (touching)
U+8CD1 賑 (touching)
U+8FB0 辰 (not touching, but too close)
U+8FB1 辱 (not touching, but too close)
U+8FB2 農 (touching)
U+8FB4 輶 (touching)
U+910F 鄔 (not touching, but too close)
U+91B2 醜 (touching)
U+92E0 銀 (touching)
U+9392 鐫 (touching)
U+9707 震 (not touching, but too close)
U+9B1E 震 (not touching, but too close)

U+9DD0 鷗 (touching)
U+9E8E 震 (touching)
U+9F48 鼾 (touching)
HKSCS (15)
U+3598 嘖 (touching)
U+47F4 踫 (touching)
U+61B9 儻 (good example of not touching)
U+6A82 穰 (touching)
U+6D71 派 (not touching, but too close)
U+71F6 爨 (good example of not touching)
U+7651 癩
U+8FB3 震 (touching)
U+20A50 辰 (touching)
U+218BF 孃 (good example of not touching)
22E0D 攬 (good example of not U+ touching)
U+24091 濃 (good example of not touching)
U+27053 襪 (good example of not touching)
270AD 蔣 (good example of not U+ touching)
U+28BC2 鑲 (good example of not touching)

That is all.